



AN OPEN LETTER TO THE GENERAL STEERING COMMITTEE OF THE  
WWF SHRIMP AQUACULTURE DIALOGUE

April 24, 2012

Dear ShAD/GSC members,

After careful and considered reflection on the draft standards and the whole WWF-ShAD (Shrimp Aquaculture Dialogue) process, we the undersigned Conscientious Objectors -- NGOs working with local communities in the shrimp producer-nations and consumers in the shrimp-importing nations -- have unanimously decided that we cannot support the ShAD General Steering Committee (ShAD/GSC) and the Aquaculture Stewardship Council's (ASC) intentions or actions towards establishing standards for shrimp aquaculture certification. Many others who have added their names and organizational affiliations to our list have also joined us in our protest.

We must therefore continue our course to speak out publicly and campaign against the intent and the process that WWF-ShAD has endeavoured to undertake. The historical record and scientific evidence both indicate that certification will do much harm to both Local Resource Users and the coastal marine environment. The following reasons stand out among many others as indicators that we COs must continue to strongly oppose the ShAD process and the intended ASC and organize a wider resistance against ShAD and other shrimp certification schemes in both Europe and the USA:

1. There has never been involvement nor representation in WWF-ShAD's so-called dialogue process for the majority of stakeholders or, more aptly, the Local Resource Users who are adversely affected by the shrimp industry in producer nations.

ShAD's "stakeholders" are overwhelmingly those invested in the growth of the shrimp-export industry.

2. With each revision to the draft, the standards and their evaluation criteria have been progressively and deliberately diluted by the GSC to ensure that at least 20% of the existing shrimp industry can be certified immediately after the Standards are released. The process clearly demonstrates the bias of the ShAD/GSC.
3. The ShAD/GSC has resolutely refrained from undertaking or commissioning serious research to collect meaningful and verifiable inputs and feedback from Local Resource Users in the manner prescribed by The Economics of Ecosystems and Biodiversity (TEEB).
4. The GSC process for selecting its board members has not been fair from the beginning and is not representative of a transparent and democratic process. As such, the standards overwhelmingly represent industry interests -- for example: the whole of Africa is "represented" on the ShAD/GSC by shrimp industry nominees from Madagascar.
5. Continued lack of proper legislation and enforcement in producer-nations makes adherence to any certification standard unfeasible.
6. ShAD puts too much trust in the industry to monitor and regulate itself. The certification programme depends upon an untried and untested auditing system. Other critical aspects of the process too require a "leap of faith" -- that previously disastrous practices will miraculously reverse their effects once the ShAD standards are released.
7. The ShAD standards continue to perpetuate unsustainable and destructive open-throughput systems of aquaculture -- with a legacy of 400,000 hectares (and counting) of abandoned ponds in producer-nations. The standards also promote bad practices relating to so-called "mitigation of the effects of mangrove loss".
8. The process conveniently ignores wide-spread community displacement, human rights violations and environmental damage to many thousands of hectares of land by the shrimp industry prior to 1999. Under the present standards, ponds in these regions could be certified. Trends indicate that they will. The ASC becomes, therefore, a confessional for the shrimp industry and will grant indulgences in the form of certification.
9. Export-oriented tropical shrimp production does not contribute towards food security. Food security should not be measured by the weight of export-production or the profit-curve of the industry, but instead by the availability of healthy and sustainable means of local food production for local consumption.
10. There remains the great risk that WWF-ShAD certification, by placing a green stamp on tropical shrimp, will actually expand the demand for farmed tropical shrimp -- both certified and uncertified -- thus promoting the continued (and possibly more rapid) expansion of unsustainable practices.
11. Feed issues are still not satisfactorily resolved and there is still no effective plan to meet increasing feed demands. The projected reliance on GM soy and palm oil is of great concern.
12. The COs had requested a breakdown of development time spent by ShAD in developing their social, environment and technical standards. We have not received this, yet.

13. ShAD/GSC and their offspring in the ASC have still not taken any direct and effective actions to influence consumers in the importing nations to reduce shrimp consumption -- extremely pertinent to the intent and purposes to any attempt at designing a certification program for shrimp.

We reiterate our demands that shrimp farming should not be located within the inter-tidal zone; it should not be allowed to affect productive agricultural lands, or displace members of local communities.

The final draft standards represent an extremely crude attempt at setting up "standards". The process demonstrates a lack of careful thought and consideration of ground realities and concern for Local Resource Users -- people who will suffer the consequences of WWF-ShAD's actions.

The GSC's position that the standards will be released regardless of their merit and consequences leaves little scope for further dialogue.

As such, we the undersigned Conscientious Objectors reject the WWF-ShAD process and its shrimp aquaculture standards.

We reaffirm our support, as always,

For the mangroves and mangrove communities,

*The Conscientious Objectors*

*Signed by:*

#### **ORGANISATIONS**

1. Pisit Charnsnoh, Yadfong Association, Thailand
2. Khushi Kabir, Nijera Kori, Bangladesh
3. Riza Damanik, KIARA (Fisheries Justice Coalition), Indonesia
4. Alfredo Quarto, Mangrove Action Project
5. Maurizio Farhan Ferrari, Forest Peoples Programme, UK
6. Natasha Ahmad, ASIA Solidarity against Industrial Aquaculture, India
7. Gudrun Hubendick, Stockholm Society for Nature Conservation, Sweden
8. Don Staniford, Global Alliance against Industrial Aquaculture
9. Maria Delgado, ECOTERRA Intl.
10. Marieke Mutsaers, Trichilia ABC, Netherlands
11. Stanislav Lhota, Univ. of South Bohemia & Usti nad Labem Zoo, Czech Republic
12. Darlene Schanfald, Olympic Environmental Council, Sequim, Washington
13. Paula Palmer, Director Global Response Program/Cultural Survival, Inc., USA
14. Diane Wilson, Calhoun County Resource Watch, USA
15. Dr. Wolfram Heise, The JAF Foundation, Switzerland
16. Foundation for Deep Ecology, USA
17. The Conservation Land Trust, USA, Argentina, Chile
18. Conservacion Patagonica, USA, Argentina
19. Fundacion Pumalin, USA, Chile
20. Joanna Levitt, International Accountability Project, USA
21. Gabriella Zanzanini, Food & Water, Europe
22. Wenonah Hauter, Executive Director, Food & Water Watch, USA
23. Nina Holland, Corporate Europe Observatory, Belgium
24. DeeVon Quirolo, Co-Founder of Reef Relief, USA
25. Guadalupe Rodriguez, Salva la Selva, Spain
26. Klaus Schenck, Rettet den Regenwald, Germany
27. Béatrice Gorez, CFFA - CAPE, Belgium
28. Anne Petermann, Global Justice Ecology Project, USA
29. Mary Bricker-Jenkins, USA-Canada Alliance of Inhabitants (USACAI), USA

30. Robert Jereski, New York Climate Action Group, USA
31. Tim Keating, Rainforest Relief, USA
32. Sylvie Cardona, d'AVES, France
33. Herman Klosius, Informationsgruppe Lateinamerika - IGLA, Austria
34. Nian Dorry, Northwest Atlantic Marine Alliance, USA
35. Dan Silver, Endangered Habitats League, USA
36. Redmanglar Internacional, Latin America
37. Jorge Varela, CODDEFFAGOLF, Honduras
38. Henderson Colina, AEPA FALCON NGO, Venezuela
39. Alianza por los manglares, Litorales, Aguas y Suelos ALMAS REDMANGLAR, Venezuela
40. La Ventana AC de Mexico, Mexico
41. Juan Carlos Cardenas, Centro Ecoceanos, Chile
42. Teresa Perez, World Rainforest Movement, Uruguay
43. Nemesio Juan Rodríguez Mitchell, PUMC-UNAM sede Oaxaca, México
44. René Schärer, Instituto Terramar, Brazil
45. Manuela Díaz Ballesteros, Asociación de Pescadores, Campesinos, afro descendientes e Indígenas para el Desarrollo Comunitario de la Ciénaga Grande del Bajo Sinú, ASPROCIG, Colombia
46. Fundación Urundei, Salta, Argentina
47. Rezwana Hasan, Bangaldesh Environmental Lawyers' Association, Bangladesh
48. Hasan Mehedi, Humanitywatch, Bangladesh
49. Shamsul Huda, Association for Land Reform and Development (ALRD), Bangladesh
50. Meghnaguha Thakurata, Research Initiatives Bangladesh (RIB), Bangladesh
51. Philip Gain, Society for Environment and Human Development (SEHD), Bangladesh
52. Khorshed Alam, Alternative Movement for Resources and Freedom Society, Bangladesh
53. Anti-Debt Coalition (KAU), Indonesia
54. Black Tiger Shrimp Farmers' Union (P3UW), Indonesia
55. Institute of Global Justice (IGJ), Indonesia
56. Berry Nahdian Furqon, Indonesia
57. Ruddy Gustave, KONPHALINDO, Indonesia
58. Muhammad Reza, Serikat Nelayan Indonesia / Indonesia Fisherfolk Union, Indonesia
59. Nurhidayat Moenir, Jaringan Kerja Pemetaan Partisipatif (JKPP), Indonesia
60. Geetha Lakmini, Food Sovereignty Network, Sri Lanka
61. Herman Kumara, National Fisheries Solidarity Movement, Sri Lanka
62. Shamith Roshan, Youth in Action (YinA), Sri Lanka
63. Thomas Kocherry, National Fishworkers' Forum (NFF), India
64. Bijaya Kumar Kabi, Action for Protection of Wild Animals (APOWA), India
65. Kunal Deb, Uthnau, India.
66. Samir Acharya, Society for Andaman and Nicobar Ecology, Port Blair, India
67. Javier M. Claparols, Ecological Society of the Philippines, IUCN-CEESP, Philippines
68. S.M. Mohamed Idris, Consumers' Association of Penang, Malaysia
69. Meenakshi Raman, Sahabat Alam Malaysia (Friends of the Earth Malaysia), Malaysia
70. Chee Yoke Ling, Third World Network, Malaysia
71. Akie Hart, Mangrove Forest Conservation Society of Nigeria
72. Tekena Opukunachukwu, Grassroots Coalition for Transparency and Good Governance, Nigeria
73. Nemi Tammuno, Rural Initiative for Community Empowerment, Nigeria
74. Shedrach Philimon, Rural Communities Development Association, Nigeria
75. Parker Lawson, Economic Empowerment and Environmental Protection Network, Nigeria
76. Ibiwari Hector, Peace and Justice Foundation, Nigeria

77. Henry Folawiyor, Child Rights Initiative, Nigeria
78. Junior Pepple, Bethaisda Environmental Foundation, Nigeria
79. Clifford Opusunju, Positive Change Advocates, Nigeria
80. Nenibarini Zabbey, Centre for Environment, Human Rights and Development (CEHRD), Nigeria
81. Ekindi Moudingo, Cameroon Wildlife Conservation Society, Cameroon
82. Edem Edem, African Mangrove Network, Nigeria
83. Wally Menne, Timberwatch Coalition, South Africa
84. Rowland Benjamin, Information for Action, Perth, Western Australia
85. Edda Kirleis, Evangelischer Entwicklungsdienst EED, Germany
86. Ashish Kothari, Kalpavriksh, India
87. Abdoulaye Diame, WAAME, Senegal
88. Jean-Marie Muanda, ADEV, Congo
89. Orijemie Akpo Emuobosa, University of Ibadan, Nigeria
90. Lydia Chaparro, Área Marina - Ecologistas en Acción, Spain
91. Salomon Abresparr, Fältbiologerna - Nature and Youth, Sweden
92. Centre National de Coopération au Développement, Belgium
93. Brian O'Riordan, ICSF Belgium Office
94. African Confederation of Artisanal Fishing Organisations (CAOPA)
95. Centre National pour la Coopération au Développement (CNCD), Belgium

## INDIVIDUALS

1. Douglas and Kristine Tompkins, USA
2. Wolfgang Gerster, Germany
3. Madhusree Mukerjee, Germany
4. Marc Robinson, France
5. Javier Mateo, Spain
6. Yara Schaeffer-Novelli, Brazil
7. Khaing Shwe, ME
8. Emily Broderick, FL
9. Wendy Lee, Jamaica "Certification that is not based on credible data and effective management is meaningless... just a form of greenwashing."
10. Htain Lin, Myanmar
11. Marc Sommer, Netherlands Antilles
12. Alain Olvera Baena, Spain
13. Kat Hollomon, United Kingdom
14. Pillar Gallego, Spain
15. Ann Truyens, Canada
16. Gabi Feijo, Brazil
17. René Scharer, Brazil
18. Marta Rivera, Spain
19. William Warren, MA "Analyses of persistent organic pollutants (COPs) should first be performed on sediment, water and shrimp tissues, the results posted on a website to show transparency, and tests be performed by companies that follow EPA standards. Thank you."
20. Alex Tagge, CA
21. Shannon Alexander, FL
22. Jess Jordan, MA
23. Jacques Mermoud, New Caledonia
24. Elin Andersson, Sweden
25. Dan Silver, CA
26. Jonathan Spinac, NY
27. Piyashi Debroy, India
28. Jean-Marie Muanda, Democratic Republic of Congo
29. Peter Zdrojewski, OH
30. Beckline Mukete, Netherlands
31. Kakolee Banerjee, India
32. Prarthi Shah, India
33. Karin Wijnand, Netherlands
34. Noor Alam, Bangladesh "I hate saline shirimp culture."
35. Bev Brewis, Canada

36. Zebedee Feka, Cameroon
37. Celeste Botha, WA
38. Ewa Piasecka, Poland
39. James Mulcare, WA
40. Bettina Lorenz, Germany
41. Natasa Legen, Croatia
42. Eternal Gardener, Australia "Do your homework WWF: greenwashing is ECOCIDE! Walk the talk!"
43. Allan Yorkowitz, NJ
44. May Howie, United Kingdom
45. Anette Stauske, Germany
46. Agnieszka Tyszkiewicz, Lithuania
47. Rebecca Brandon, Australia
48. Peter Kralovic, Slovakia
49. Elzbieta Gotkowska, Poland
50. Mary Hebblewhite, GA
51. Steve Klein, Canada
52. Lene Harries, Denmark
53. Mageswari Sangaralingam, Malaysia
54. Mary Truelove, IN
55. Alan Francisco, CA
56. Debora Freriks, Netherlands
57. Thomas Moore, TX
58. David Lobina, Sweden
59. Theodore Spachidakis, Greece
60. Elizabeth Reynolds, United Kingdom
61. Thomas Gordon, MO
62. Rachel Martin, United Kingdom
63. Roger Monk, United Kingdom
64. Victoria McFarlane, United Kingdom
65. Danielle Herie, Canada
66. Teresa Wlosowicz, Poland
67. Iwona Krzeminska, Poland
68. Gretchen Craig, NY
69. Julian Lang, CA "Please respect local voices when establishing standards than can impact negatively their local environments as this proposed WWF- ShAD action surely will."
70. Tom Stilwell, NC
71. Hege Torset, Norway
72. Julia Bateman, Ukraine
73. Regina Powell, CA
74. Arthur J, PA
75. Joanna Walczak, Poland
76. Gordana Roljic, Serbia And Montenegro
77. Tonie Wickman, Sweden "Certification is normally a good thing but when it comes to tropical shrimp aquaculture it is different. There is a need to be careful as no systems so far has proven to fulfill standards needed for a certification worth the name. With bad systems being certified all certifications risk to loose confidence, which would spoil possibilities for a sustainable future."
78. Maren Heinig, Australia
79. Anissa Reed, Canada "There is no right way to do the wrong thing!"
80. Elishia Windfohr, CA
81. Margaret Runfors, Sweden
82. Tahoma Khalsa, WA
83. Pocho Alvarez, Ecuador
84. Debbie Williams, WV
85. Juan Manuel Guevara, Ecuador "Un apoyo total, estoy en contra de la tala indiscriminada del manglar que nos afecta a todos, y a las poblaciones usuarias directamente."
86. Sandra Rocha, Portugal
87. Karren Exley, United Kingdom
88. Susan Benway, VT

89. Kendra Richardson, Canada
90. Norm Conrad, WA
91. Bill C, Germany
92. Olga Sokolova, Russian Federation
93. Lynette Zizzo, NY
94. Sami Signorino, IN
95. Vukan Simic, Serbia And Montenegro
96. Alex Tan, Canada
97. Szilvia Molnar, Hungary
98. Mireille Picron, Belgium
99. Carrie Gleason, AZ
100. Monica Gutierrez-Quarto, WA
101. Karen Drissi, Tunisia
102. Harsha Vardhana R, India
103. Lou Baxter, Australia
104. Diane Berings, Belgium
105. Christophe Bazin, France
106. Matjaz Bratus, Slovenia
107. Marina Dobraya, CA
108. Ann Rybalka, Ukraine
109. Vlado Gasperov, Croatia
110. George Theobald, Australia
111. Aletta Kraan, Canada
112. Gudrun Dennis, FL
113. Nicole Weber, MD
114. Cindy Collier, United Kingdom
115. Patricia Myers, NY
116. Rejanne Albuquerque, Brazil
117. Susan M R, Ireland
118. Brenda Collins, United Kingdom
119. Andy Walker, United Kingdom
120. Marta de la Fuente, Spain
121. Hester Low, Singapore
122. Hallie Brotherton, WV
123. Kathleen Basiewicz, NC
124. Amber Caine, GA
125. Patrick Donovan, NY "The world's food supply is too fragile for haphazard and biased rule making."
126. Darini Suthasakul, Thailand
127. Ana Fuentes, Uruguay
128. CJ Johnson, VA
129. Emma Spurgin Hussey, United Kingdom
130. Michael Kirkby, Canada
131. Beatrice de Filippis, Yemen
132. Victoria Molinari, WA
133. Val Rose, CO
134. Isabel Esteve, Spain
135. David Erik Barsati, Sweden
136. Danny Madzhurova, Bulgaria
137. Irina Tikhomirova, Russian Federation
138. HP Garden, United Kingdom
139. Xana Barroso, Portugal
140. Albert Mah, Australia
141. Jana F., South Africa
142. Fran Fulwiler, OR
143. Elena Podgosnik, Russian Federation
144. Per Stenbeck, Sweden
145. Hasmukh Jiwa, India
146. Beth Burrows, USA
147. Yvonne Thiemann, Germany
148. Anne Cook, WA
149. Matthias Bauer, Germany
150. Valentino Martinelli, Germany

151. Michael Skazick, United Kingdom
152. Eva Cardona, Spain
153. Albert Hamann, Germany
154. Thaddäus Bielefeld, Germany
155. Sebastian Lasse, Germany
156. Cecilia Bowerman, Australia
157. Margy Stewart, CA
158. Patricia Matejcek, CA
159. Karilyn Shephard, Trinidad And Tobago
160. Tamara Segrt, Serbia And Montenegro
161. John Schertow, Canada
162. Helen Golding, United Kingdom
163. Gharsallah Mohamed, Saudi Arabia
164. Bruce Sandison, United Kingdom
165. Gabriela Fonseca, Ecuador
166. Valli Sanstrom, WA
167. Carten Meyer, Germany
168. Nicolette Ludolphi, Germany
169. Jean Luc Tortiller, France
170. Marija Popovic, Serbia And Montenegro
171. Kayleigh Rhodes, United Kingdom
172. Lalla Bock, Switzerland
173. Marco Baracca, Italy
174. Kelly Kalinke, Germany
175. Toni Adisano, NY
176. Rik Reynolds, WA "Shrimp farming is destructive to the environment."
177. Katja Relford, Germany
178. Chrissy Henker, Germany
179. Jennifer Curtis, MS
180. Zannah Mustapha, Nigeria
181. Balin Hansen, WA
182. Katherine Garnett, NM
183. Dennis Kaplan, OH
184. Nikos Pastos, AK "Standards for shrimp certification must be inclusive of local shrimp users."
185. Hasmukh Jiwa, India
186. Oumar Balde, Congo
187. David Dow, MA
188. Vivian Newman, ME
189. William Newman, ME
190. Vanditta Diwakar, Fiji
191. Angie Chapman, United Kingdom
192. Kathi Corrigan, NH
193. Cl Ripley, NY
194. Katella Ting, CA
195. A Montgomery, FL
196. Vika Babakova, Ukraine
197. Carolyn Hayton, Australia
198. Serena Wittkopp, OR
199. Michelle Hodges, United Kingdom
200. Cristiano Pinnow, Brazil
201. Amelie Laurent, France
202. Imelda Avendano, TX
203. Sherry Dillon, MD
204. Patti LePage, MO
205. Gabriela Seabra, Portugal
206. Richard Hieber, Germany
207. Marion Laval Jeantet, France
208. Barbara Mindermann, France
209. Catherine Hammond, MD
210. Lee Lockwood, DC
211. Amanda Carter, NY
212. Pamela Kirkham, ON



213. John Taylor, MA
214. Karin Lehnigk, VA
215. Amy E Stroud, TX
216. Danuta Watola, Poland
217. Chris McLaughlin, MA
218. Kathy Parsons, United Kingdom
219. Chantal Buslot, Belgium
220. Maria E Lozano Marin, Spain
221. Francis M Cone, US
222. Gawel Solowski, Poland
223. Ana Gutierrez, Nicaragua
224. Mark M Giese, WI
225. Paul Wilson, WV
226. Agnes Wojciechowska, Poland
227. Dominic Delarmente, Philippines
228. Gawel Solowski, Poland